BOOK REVIEWS


With the publication of this book, we can now add islandology to nissology and island studies as yet another term vying to be the accepted label for this emerging interdisciplinary field. Marc Shell’s Islandology is an ambitious and comprehensive review of the etymology, history and philosophy of islands, as reflected in the humanities. Shell notes that the term islandology originated with the 1945 Washington-based American Institute of Islandology. He defines the term variously as the ‘discourse that marks off human beings not only as children of the main, understood not only as both ‘land’ and ‘sea’ but also as creatures of the natural shore who inhabit, at once, both positive and negative space’ (p.4), as “the rhetoric of speaking about islands and to the science [italics in original] of islands” (p.7) and finally as involving “less the fact of being an island – since what landmass is not an island? – than the hypothesis that there are different ways of conceiving the natural insular condition in terms both political and individual” (p.247).

The book is presented in four parts. The first is an exercise in etymology, including an extended discussion of definitions of islands and related terms, a description of real and metaphorical islands, as well as occasions where islands are represented in the ‘vertical’ and the ‘horizontal’ planes. Islands in the vertical plane would include tidal changes, plate tectonics, land bridges and sea-level changes. Horizontal planes might be ‘land surrounded by water’, ancient thinkers’ views of Earth as a part of the Milky Way and archipelagos. Interestingly, this section and those that follow make extensive use of the ‘island as metaphor’ theme with no reference to the critical, ongoing debate about the usefulness of these metaphorical applications. The second section of the book consists of a description of islands in various geographic spaces and places and the human constructions of these islands. These include, for example, utopian islands in literature (e.g., Huxley’s Island and More’s Utopia) and in reality (e.g., Venice, Hormuz). The third and fourth parts of the book, which comprise almost half of its contents, consist of two case study sections. The first is an analysis of Shakespeare’s Hamlet, studied from an islandness perspective. Although the word ‘islandness’ is used here, the reader is not made aware that this is very much a value-laden word in scholarly research, wherein a comprehensive body of work has attempted to understand islandness from a variety of perspectives. The second case study is a deconstruction of the island-themed work of German authors, poets and composers, undertaken in order to better understand the influence these works may have had on the political and cultural development of the 20th century German state. Following these four sections, Shell has provided an 18-page ‘postamble’. I found this to be an odd assortment of thoughts and ideas that seemed to not quite fit the subject matter of the previous four sections. The most notable feature in this concluding section is a commentary on the contributions and links to island contexts by some of the more prominent historical geographers of the time, including Mackinder, Ratzel and Haushofer.

The 82 illustrations and figures contained in this text provide a richness to the portrayal of islands in various media that is rarely, if ever, seen in other island studies writing. In fact, the level of detail, the meticulous research, and the scope and scale of examples provided in this book is nothing short of amazing. For example, Shell estimates that he has referenced more than 800 islands and 200 bodies of water. The danger inherent in this breadth is that a
book becomes encyclopedic; yet, Shell is able to skillfully weave together original references and stories of islands into a coherent whole, as portrayed in a wide swath of media, including literature, art, poetry, music and cinema.

One of the redeeming values of this book is also its most prominent flaw. As alluded to above, the arguments make little reference to the current debates and jargon in island studies. Two additional examples help to illustrate this point. First, while most social science-oriented island studies scholars refer to islands shared by two or more states as ‘divided islands’, Shell labels them ‘condominium’ islands: not a common usage of the term, since the only known example of a condominium is the Anglo-French parallel governance of the Vanuatu/New Hebrides archipelago (1906-1980). Second, in discussing the autonomy and sovereignty of islands, Shell makes no reference to the emerging discussion on sub-national island jurisdictions (or SNIs). In fact, Shell’s reflections on social science-inspired island studies research appear to be limited to medical and public health. Granted: engaging in an argument without referencing extant contributions from different fields can lead to refreshing insights, akin to seeing something with a fresh pair of eyes. However, by not incorporating the political science-inspired research on island sovereignty issues, the book fails in an opportunity to make interdisciplinary connections that could lead to new insights on island studies debates. In what are still the early stages in the interdisciplinary field of enquiry of island studies, these disconnected forays are something we might expect. However, isn’t it a shame that exceptional work is being undertaken in relative isolation of debates on the same issues by scholars trained in different disciplines?

Although the following are relatively minor shortcomings that should not distract from the overall contributions of the book, they deserve to be noted. First, many of the chapter titles and sub-headings seem to be hyperbolic and do not reflect the content of the sections. For example, in a section enticingly titled “Islands Razed and Raised”, we are provided with a two-page discussion from Herodotus on the destruction of the bridges across the Dardanelles by the Persian King Xerxes and the subsequent building of a channel to turn the peninsula at Mount Athos into an island. Chapter 5 is titled “Cities in Straits” when it really should have been titled “Island Cities”. Only the first two of the 24 pages in this chapter deal with islands in straits; while the rest of the chapter discusses examples of island cities. The objectives for many of the chapters also seem to be buried and the reader is rarely provided with chapter conclusions or summaries, so we are left to draw together main points from the many island literary references.

I would recommend this book for any island studies student or scholar, whether they are approaching this field using a humanities or a social sciences lens. In fact, there is much in this manuscript that should be of interest to all academics who have an affinity for islands, regardless of their disciplinary background.

James E. Randall
University of Prince Edward Island, Canada
jarandell@upei.ca

Derived from the geographic term for ‘[a]ny sea, or sheet of water, in which there are numerous islands; and trans. a group of islands’ (p. 9), ‘archipelago’ is a term which allows for a significant and productive re-imagining of the island relations across the landscapes and seascapes of the British and Irish Isles. John Brannigan’s Archipelagic modernism answers the call for a more ‘plural and connective vision’ of the Atlantic Archipelago, one which ‘stress[es] in neutral and plural terms the relationship between those islands’ (p. 9) on either side of the Irish Sea. Such work has, in recent years, begun to emerge from a literary perspective, with texts such as John Kerrigan’s Archipelagic English (2008) and Philip Schwyzer and Simon Mealor’s Archipelagic identities (2004), already making waves within ‘archipelagic’ frameworks. Such literary perspectives have however tended to focus on the anglophone literatures of the seventeenth century and have rarely been attempted in relation to modern texts. Brannigan’s Archipelagic modernism thus stands out as the first work to trace the different political geographies and ecologies of the Atlantic archipelago, present within late-nineteenth and twentieth-century writings. Across five chapters, Brannigan deftly draws out the significance of oceanic space, physical (is)landscapes and liminal coastlines within the works of some of the most significant modernist writers of the 1920s and 1930s. Brannigan’s book marks an important departure point for scholars contemplating the present state of the Atlantic archipelago.

Each chapter works to draw out the politics of place and the specific locality of environments in well-known modernist works which have perhaps been bypassed by the recent rise of the environmental humanities. Turning his attention to the writings of Yeats, Synge, Joyce, Woolf and MacDiarmid (to name but a few), Brannigan’s argument specifically counteracts Pete Hay’s 2006 assertion (made in this journal) that literary perspectives of the archipelago “exhibit an understandable tendency to see the reality of islands as of less interest and import than the ‘virtual’ status of the island as metaphor” (p. 26). Archipelagic modernism works to bring the mythic and metaphoric back to the material. For Brannigan, this can only occur through the ‘greening of modernism’, by drawing specific attention to the physicality of space and place present within iconic modernist novels such as Portrait of the artist as a young man, Ulysses, and To the lighthouse. The most difficult challenge for Brannigan is how one can actually draw such spatial attention to these works, born as they are of an era of abstraction, allusion and symbolism. For Brannigan, it is only by considering these texts “associated with symbolism and metaphorical modes of representation” (p. 10) through a perspective that is “resolutely material” (p. 10) that we can begin to reconsider their classically ‘virtual’ status. These “resolutely material perspectives” are explored not simply by highlighting the various landscapes present in texts, but through an historical materialism which draws attention to the ‘grounded’ discourses of both natural and human sciences. Each chapter is laced with excursions into anthropology, botany, ethnography and cartography, terms which are most productively understood and captured by the term ‘ecology’, a term which Brannigan employs without providing any detailed definition.

In his first chapter, ‘Folk Revivals and Island Utopias’, Brannigan offers an interesting alternative reading of the modernist era, with its familiar focus on metropolitan hubs and cities, instead drawing our attention to the coastlines and cultures of Ireland’s Aran Islands.
Centring on J. M. Synge’s *The Aran islands* (1907), Brannigan traces the ethnographic exploration of culture and language present within early modernist texts, and describes how island space is figured as an almost ethereal and folkloric realm, “remote from corruptions” (p. 43). Focusing on the “validity of folk wisdom and custom” (p. 52) present within this ‘primitive’ and ‘pure’ place, the chapter addresses the importance of island space in relation to the Celtic Revival period. For Brannigan, the island imaginings of Synge and Yeats work to foster “alternate forms of living [and] alternative moralities, to cast against the values represented by the metropolis and Empire” (p. 49). They are thus effectively counterpoised against an English cultural homogeneity. Islands here are viewed as insular and isolated formulations which ideologically attach to the sovereign movements of Irish nationalism. This concept is furthered, and thankfully challenged, within the second chapter, ‘James Joyce and the Irish Sea’, in which Brannigan argues for the importance of addressing not only the ‘group of islands’ which constitute the archipelago, but the ocean spaces and seascapes which connect them. Viewing the Irish Sea as a sort of ‘British Mediterranean’, Brannigan traces the ebb and flow of seas, waves, and shorelines within Joyce’s oeuvre and in so doing reconsider the previously asserted insularity of island space. What emerges is no longer an isolated instance of ‘purity’ and ‘primitivism’ but rather a world that is “differential, variegated, contested, and interdependent [...] an archipelagic world” (p. 93). Laced with the history of maritime engineering, this chapter draws out the intricacies of commerce and communication which are bonded to ports, harbours and migratory routes and serves to highlight the dynamism of the Irish Sea. Marked by crossings and currents, Joyce’s works are, for Brannigan, indicative of a newly mobile imagination, one which is created through the “constant intermeshing of the material and the literary or symbolic” (p. 79).

Perhaps the greatest challenge for Brannigan arises in chapter 3, ‘Virginia Woolf and the Geographical Subject’, where Woolf’s notorious textual slippages and mythologies present a distinct obstacle to the precise identification of space. Addressing these issues through the analysis of ‘accuracy’ as a gendered perspective, Brannigan seeks to understand Woolf’s “strange geography” as indicative of a resistance to contemporaneous geopolitical and patriarchal systems of categorization and knowledge. Woolf’s *To The Lighthouse* (1927) is thus considered as emblematic of a new form of representation through an alternate image system which mixes both art and science in the creation of literary space. Invoking the language of the ‘shipping forecast’, Brannigan attempts to bring a climatic element to this chapter, focusing on weather and seasons while also highlighting the turning of the political tide of the late 1920s. While this chapter is enlightening in its attempt to give a new reading of ‘Eco-Woolf’, Brannigan’s assessment of Woolf’s ‘islanding’ as a critique of imperialism does ultimately fall back into the abstract realm of myth and metaphor and at times argues against the archipelagic dimensions detailed in his introduction. Indeed, the deeper one sinks into *Archipelagic modernism*, the more the archipelago becomes an increasingly contested site, not only in the works analysed, but more significantly in Brannigan’s own conceptions of the term.

Perhaps recognizing this, the closing two chapters – ‘Literary Topographies of a Northern Archipelago’, and ‘Social Bonds and Gendered Borders in Late Modernism’ – attempt to reassert the plurality and porous ideology of the archipelago. For Brannigan, “in contrast to nationalist appropriations of islands as cultural and racial repositories [...] and imperialist figures of islands as symbolic origins, the literature of islands in the 1930s is inherently connective, relational, and material” (p. 146). For Brannigan, it is only in the later works of Louis MacNeice and Hugh MacDiarmid that such interconnections and relational
perspectives begin to emerge. This multiplicity arises in part due to the various political shifts of the late 1920s and 1930s when the very notion of the ‘wholeness’ and territorial integrity of ‘Britain’, ‘England’, or the ‘United Kingdom’ was undermined politically and culturally by the emergent sovereignty of the Irish Free State (1922) and its constitutional claim to the ‘whole island of Ireland’ (1937), by the Scottish Renaissance of the 1920s, by the formation of Plaid Cymru in Wales (1925) and the Scottish National Party (1934), and by the palpable decline of British imperial power across the globe. (p. 147)

The ‘destabilization’ of Britain opens the floodgates in terms of relational writing and archipelagic focus. The closing chapters are excellent in their attention to the poetic and political dimensions of this fragmentation and serve to shore up Brannigan’s argument where it had perhaps started to go astray. Despite this closing confidence, the decision to take these archipelagic investigations only as far as 1970 seems an odd choice. One can easily construct a comparable timeline of destabilization post-1970 with the ascending violence of the Irish ‘Troubles’, the first rumbles of devolution in the ‘failed’ referendum of 1979, the end of Empire in relation to the Falklands (1980s) and Hong Kong in the (1990s), the subsequent ‘devolutionary’ period of writing in Scotland and the establishment of the devolved governments in 1998 and the Good Friday Agreement. Devolution seems to be the ultimate formulation of archipelagic ideology, encouraging the peoples of the British and Irish islands to reconsider and reimagine their relations with one another, and thus seems a strange and glaring omission within this book. But perhaps this is the point. Archipelagic modernism serves as an important grounding text for an increasingly emergent and urgent academic archipelago.

Alexandra Campbell
University of Glasgow
Scotland, UK
a.campbell.3@research.gla.ac.uk


Larry Grimes introduces *Hemingway, Cuba, and the Cuban works* (2014) by referring to the book as a “first expedition” into the unchartered waters of the life of American author and journalist Ernest Hemingway on the Caribbean island he called home from 1939-1960. Grimes’ assertion is ironically refuted by valuable bibliographies by Kelli A. Larson and Ned Quevedo Arnaiz within the book itself, which document robust attempts by both Cuban and American scholars since the 1970s (and presumably much earlier) to analyze and assess Hemingway’s life and work in Cuba. Nevertheless, Grimes’ compilation of a relatively understudied period in Ernest Hemingway’s life is still meritorious. A rather ragtag mix of personal memoir, interviews, book excerpts, criticism, and bibliography makes the book not necessarily the most unilateral or linear of texts to date, but rather an attempt to bring together a wide range of voices regarding Hemingway’s life in Cuba. As a result, the collection serves as a cross-section of work by both Cuban and American writers on how Cuba influenced Hemingway’s writing.
One way in which the book explores this influence is by including essays that reveal Cuba as a site of experimentation with modernist art forms. As James Nagel’s “Hemingway’s Impressionist Islands” suggests, Hemingway found in Cuba a template for exploring Parisian impressionism but also “to bring alive, in an immediate, tactile way, the world Hudson lives in and his relation to it” (p. 252). At another point in the book, Grimes points to the influence that Cuba’s Afro-Cuban religious syncretism had on Hemingway’s work. As Grimes writes, the island’s history as a slave colony continues to live on in a rich Afro-Cuban folklore and a syncretic religion called Santería, which Hemingway himself not only practised but incorporated into his fiction. As Grimes asserts, “By the time Hemingway wrote the final draft of *The old man and the sea*, his understanding of Afro-Cuban religion had deepened and he was able to incorporate specific symbols and cosmology from those religions into his novella” (p. 155). The notion of island as a creolized spiritual realm – Grimes mentions that the Virgin of Cobre is both “Mary, Mother of God, and Ochún, African goddess of rivers” – is yet another key religious concept that Hemingway consistently explored in his multiple portrayals of Afro-Cuban characters, lore, symbolism, and religious beliefs (p. 154).

In addition to its portrayal of these influences, the text underscores important complexities when engaging in discourses about islands, and in particular, Caribbean islands. Using Hemingway’s *Islands in the stream* as a prime example, it is clear that islands do not exist as trenchant and unwavering spaces. This is evidenced via the dichotomy the book presents of Cuba as symbolic of both trauma and regeneration in Hemingway’s island narratives. For example, the book never fully confirms whether *Islands in the stream* is a novel of a renowned American painter Thomas Hudson’s regeneration or self-destruction after Hudson leaves Bimini for Cuba; in fact, one could argue that Bimini’s islands are far more idyllic than Cuba, which is characterized by Hudson’s German U-boat searches, heavy drinking, and struggles with his sons’ deaths. The very fact that Kim Moreland’s “Death by Drowning: Trauma Theory and *Islands in the stream*” precedes Lawrence R. Broer’s “Sea of Plenty: The Artist’s Role in *Islands in the stream*” elucidates the complex Cuban paradoxes often present in Hemingway’s novels. While Moreland seems focused on protagonist Thomas Hudson’s “dying fall,” interpreting the novel as a “narrative of profound loss marked by uncanny repetition” (p. 213), Broer suggests that *Islands in the stream* ultimately conceptualizes “a universe in harmony with itself, whose major symbols are the life-giving and spiritually regenerative sea, the Gulf Stream, the islands of the Caribbean, and the creatures of the ocean world” (p. 231). These contradictory visions of Hemingway’s island corpus do not necessarily expose the limitations but rather the possibilities that emerge when interpreting the island and its literature as both traumatic and promising. Ultimately, the book’s incorporation of distinct interpretations of *Islands in the Stream* provides new discourses for comparative island studies. Readers might consider, for example, how Bimini might be juxtaposed against Cuba as a result of these distinct articles.

However, at the same time, the book cannot resolve or dispel the political nature of such an island paradox vis-à-vis U.S.-Cuban relations since Castro’s takeover. Indeed, the book documents such political challenges via the discursive tugs-of-war that take place between Cuban and American scholars who are, ironically, contributing writers. For example, Jorge Santos Caballero’s “Hemingway: Parody or Pastiche?” critiques Hemingway for his apparently myopic stock portrayal of Cuban revolutionaries in *To have and have not*, stating that Hemingway fails to differentiate historically between ABC revolutionaries and “freedom fighters ... who fought idealistically for the sake of the country” (p. 11). However, Larry
Grimes, the editor of the collection, contests Caballero’s thesis to some extent later on in the book when he writes that Hemingway used “detailed” newspaper accounts from journalist Richard Armstrong for the novel in order to “...insure accuracy in his portrayal of the more recent revolutionary activities” (p. 75).

An additional example of such schisms occurs with writers who question earlier assertions about Hemingway’s life in Cuba. For example, William Deibler’s “The Fishing Was Good, Too” dissects and critiques Cuban writers’ myth-making regarding undocumented stories about Hemingway’s relationship with Jane Mason, describing Enrique Cirules’ claims about Hemingway’s trips to Havana to pursue Jane as “stories” of possible “rumor, folklore, or fantasy” (p. 71). Long-time director of the Finca Vigía Museum (1980-1997), Gladys Rodríguez Ferrero, also attempts to correct a nationalist approach to Hemingway studies, arguing that while many (presumably American) scholars choose to discuss Hemingway’s relationships with other American writers of his times, “Hemingway’s Cuban works have many points of contact” with Cuban writers such as Enrique Serpa and Carlos Montenegro (p. 5). Russian attaché to Mexico Yuri Paporov undercuts many American attempts to absolve Hemingway from his pro-Castro sentiments in a rather controversial, edgy chapter translated and taken from his important book, *Hemingway na kube*, which was published in Moscow in 1979. In this chapter, Paporov chronicles Hemingway’s pro-revolutionary sympathies, which included his caring for a revolutionary female university student (p. 18). Ultimately, these contentious pieces are indicative of what Yoichiro Miyamoto describes as “two interpretive communities” in his article on *The old man and the sea* (p. 180). As Miyamoto’s study of Cold War politics in *The old man and the sea* reveals, Hemingway island studies are inherently political in nature. As a result, while the book endeavours to unify and cohere Hemingway island studies, it ends up revealing the underlying political tension that manifests itself in the contentious debate that the book documents.

In all, though, these debates characterize the book’s strengths. While the book’s structure tends to be rather frenetic, it reveals that the intellectual scholarship that occurs vis-à-vis island nations can be challenging to situate. This messy, Inter-American compilation ultimately includes some wonderfully engaging material on a topic that merits much greater attention from those who might see Cuba myopically as a backyard playground for Hemingway, or an escape from the cruel Great Depression and post-WWII politics. The text shows, by way of an inclusively political and open-ended collection, that island nations involve gratifying complexities regarding the production of art. As such, *Hemingway, Cuba, and the Cuban works* showcases the myriad possibilities of Caribbean island studies, revealing many fresh directions for burgeoning scholars.

Sarah Driscoll
PhD candidate, Arizona State University, USA
sedrisco@yahoo.com


Let me say at the outset, this is a very good text book. True to the title, it does indeed provide a comprehensive introduction to the green economy. The authors believe that what differentiates
the green economy from traditional economic approaches is its relationship to the environment, and for this reason, emphasis is placed here on the underlying ecological processes and principles. One can liken the whole concept of striving to make the world a better place to a Swiss wristwatch that requires an intricate system of moving parts in order to accurately tell the time. I would be at a loss to adequately explain how all the different wheels, springs and pinions are crafted together to make a watch work perfectly. In the same way, all the required mechanisms to provide the foundations for pursuing a green economy are equally complex as well as constantly changing. The authors have admirably succeeded by firstly presenting the scientific principles of sustainability before methodically going on to detail how the green economy is widely seen as a potential solution to the current global economic and environmental crisis.

The authors state the green economy is one of the most exciting ideas of our times but recognize there is considerable uncertainty about what it actually entails, how it should be developed, and what its impacts might be. Many aspects of the green economy are currently the focus of controversy and debate. At the same time, the green economy is developing rapidly, with new products and services continually emerging. To take advantage of these opportunities, and to help the green economy achieve its potential, there is an urgent need for people with appropriate knowledge, skills and understanding. This book has been produced to help meet this need. The text is based on a new Green Economy MSc course that both authors recently developed at Bournemouth University, which is the first of its kind. Their motivation for developing this course, which is entirely delivered by distance learning, was to support those people interested in pursuing a career in the green economy.

The origins and variety of green economy definitions emanating from different organizations and numerous reports are succinctly presented in the introduction to this book. The authors’ intention of not setting out to promote a particular point of view or to identify consensus, is clearly evident from the start. Their objective is to encourage the reader to critically evaluate the evidence derived from the latest published research and to draw their own conclusions. To aid in this process, each chapter is peppered with highlighted ‘Reflection points’, some 125 in total, that pose a series of questions. In addition, there are 20 distinct entries with other suggested learning activities for the reader to explore further. Admittedly, someone with little or no background knowledge on the subject may feel rather shell-shocked after being under a constant bombardment of facts, with little time to digest before the next chapter salvo hits. Thankfully, the layout of each chapter – with numerous figures, tables, box sections and a comprehensive bibliography – means that the book can be dipped into or returned to in stages. The well enumerated content pages and detailed list of acronyms and abbreviations at the start of the book, together with a good index enable the reader to quickly pinpoint specific areas of interest.

Within the introductory chapter, I would have liked to have seen a section on the emerging blue economy concept that advocates the same desired outcome as the green economy. The United Nations Environment Program defines a green economy as one that results in “improved human well-being and social equity, while significantly reducing environmental risks and ecological scarcities.” For Small Island Developing States (SIDS) in particular, the blue economy approach to sustainability may be much better suited to their particular circumstances, constraints and challenges since it focuses on such areas as fishing; shipping and maritime transport; coastal tourism; marine energy (fossil and renewable); pharmaceutical and cosmetic industries; genetic resources and general sea-based products; and
blue carbon trading opportunities. Then again, perhaps it would take another book to adequately explain all the nuances of the blue economy.

On the plus side, the last chapter does make reference to the degrowth movement that is gathering strength in Europe and North America. This social movement advocates equitable downscaling of production and consumption that will reduce societies’ throughput of energy and raw materials. Renouncing economic growth in the North, say the proponents, would not only allow humanity to stay within the ecological limits of the planet but also contribute to restoring global social justice. In practice, degrowth is compatible with many grassroots projects already happening on islands that are adopting elements of the green economy model such as: community owned renewable energy systems, self-provisioning through organic food production; local currencies or bartering; housing cooperatives, waste reduction and reuse initiatives.

The coda to this book wonders if readers might be left feeling a little dazed and confused. They should not be as the authors have achieved their aim of explaining a complex subject using a strongly interdisciplinary approach based on environmental science and by engaging readers to constantly question the diversity of opinions that exists. The authors pose a final question. Can the green economy offer us genuine hope for the future, or is it just a utopian dream or a passing fad? Like the authors, I do believe that individual behaviour matters. It is the daily decisions that each of us takes that can help make the world a better place. Whether we try to consume less, reduce our carbon emissions, recycle our waste, or purchase green goods and services, it can all make a difference. Although our individual actions might seem trivial, they are now being multiplied as evidenced by the growing number of island communities around the world from Barbados to Hawai’i that are actively embracing the green economy, and the Seychelles who are at the vanguard of promoting the blue economy.

Graeme Robertson
Executive Director, Global Islands Network
Secretary, International Small Islands Studies Association
graeme@globalislands.net


The concept of a “partially independent territory” (PIT) is that of a nationalistically distinct polity that shares and divides some sovereign powers with a sovereign (core) state (p. 82). As such, it combines notions of elusive nationalism with the more positivist assessment of a division of powers. The book’s point of departure is an observation that is rigorously backed by statistical results: many of the inhabitants of the world’s sovereign states are poorer, less secure, and less stable when compared to the residents of these PITs. And this is the irony of the 21st century: one where the international system is arguably driven by and organized in terms of sovereign states; whereas (some of) these sovereign states themselves have taken initiatives that have spawned subnational units that operate with some autonomy yet without full sovereignty. This is the new terrain of the changing nature of the international system that secures core focus in this text.
Puerto Rico is the PIT that gets the most detailed treatment in this fascinating book: it is, according to the author, the world’s largest island PIT by population, and the one jurisdiction that has stretched, and still continues to challenge, the capacity for creative governance amongst US lawmakers. Other cases that benefit from considerable scrutiny include Scotland, Catalonia, Hong Kong and Iraqi Kurdistan. All four entities have been embroiled of late in initiatives that manifest their flexing political muscle, with the option of full independence a tantalizing (but according to Rezvani, not necessarily the smartest) prospect.

The book contains 10 chapters, organized in three sections, followed by four rich data appendices. Chapter 1 makes the case for PITs as distinct entities that merit being studied on their own terms, if anything because of their proven effectiveness in securing political and economic benefits for their citizens as well as for their core metropolitan patron state. Chapter 2 draws on the political science literature about integralism, federalism and (neo)-functionalism to cogently explain the origins and enduring existence of PITs. Chapters 3-5 review in detail what are the mechanisms that make self-determination possible, with a special focus on territories that are, or have been for some time, under the purview of the United Kingdom (such as Bermuda) and the United States (such as Puerto Rico). Rezvani offers an interesting set of data in his appendices, including a listing of 66 PITs with details of the dates when they secured their autonomous status. (The oldest PITs are the Channel Islands, Guernsey and Jersey: autonomous according to Rezvani since 1744; but possibly since 1204.) Autonomy is not always credible: the author uses Chapter 6 to expose and discuss cases of ‘sham federation’ whereby a supposedly autonomous status may be none other than a form of neo-colonialism. Chapter 7 foregrounds the role and emergence of PITs by looking at the historical emergence, strengths and weaknesses of sovereign states, culminating in the contemporary post-Westphalian regime. Having thus profiled SS and PITs, Chapter 8 engages in some interesting comparative quantitative number-crunching (while controlling for population), confirming the superior performance of the PITs. Chapter 9 discusses the historical conditions that have led to the disappearance of some PITs (including the securing of full independence or the absorption into symmetrical federalist regimes as in Canada and the US). Chapter 10 wraps up the argument, reaffirming the case that PITs make viable and attractive alternatives to full independence.

This book makes a bold claim: that it is the first book that systematically discusses the existence, origins, maintenance, and occasional termination, of partially independent territories in international and comparative politics. Had the author acknowledged more of the growing literature about subnational island jurisdictions (SNIJs), such a statement would have been placed in better scientific and historical perspective. Indeed, there is no reference to the manner in which geography, and islandness in particular, facilitates the generation of both specific national distinctiveness as well as a physical circumstance that, coupled with distance from the core state, demands local administrative machinery that, given adroit political leadership, can very well advance with time to secure autonomy status.

As with all political classifications, Rezvani has had to determine at what point a jurisdiction is no longer fully independent. He has chosen to classify two European continental microstates of Monaco, and Liechtenstein (but not, San Marino, Andorra or the Holy See) as well as the three Pacific ‘Compact’ states of Palau, Federated States of Micronesia and the Marshall Islands, all with full UN membership, as partially independent, fielding the argument that these entities have, possibly irrevocably, entered into legal ‘mutuality commitments’
whereby they have devolved some of their sovereign powers to other, larger states (p. 90). I disagree with this classification: the devolution of power is in itself an act of sovereignty (and may, in extremis, be reversed); moreover, with Rezvani’s own benchmark, all 28 member states of the European Union would therefore be PITs, given the extent of devolved powers to Brussels. In any case, these scholarly debates are illustrative of the fuzzy nature of sovereignty: the very condition that makes PITs possible, and even attractive.

Rezvani proposes 66 PITs (of which 43 are islands, or on islands). He may have inadvertently left out other examples that also benefit from *de jure* or *de facto* asymmetrical (and not, as Rezvani argues, symmetrical) federalism. These include the provinces of Canada (notably Quebec, a recognized nation) and the components of various other federal-like systems around the world that have some degree of autonomy and executive power – as with the region of Crete (Greece) or the local authority of Shetland (Scotland, UK). In the case of the latter, one of the complications of (sub)nationalism is that jurisdictions may be nested into each other, living with different layers of jurisdiction. Then there are various other cases which the author deems to be “modern colonies” (p. 92) where full constitutional powers are nested in the metropolitan power. I am troubled by this categoric claim since tensions between, say, local elected politicians and the Governor appointed by the Queen (in the case of the UK examples) suggest all but unidirectional power dynamics. Even tiny Pitcairn, the UK’s last dependency in the Pacific, mounted a resolute charge against Britain’s right to meddle in its internal affairs during its child sex abuse trials (The claim was, I believe, too hurriedly dismissed by the judges.)

Compared to the world’s great powers, PITs have small populations. Most of them have relatively small economies. They do not engage in war. Some may therefore think that they do not matter. Such observers should think again. (p. 300).

Rezvani is right: as subnational jurisdictions, PITs are not just here to stay, challenging the presumed hegemony of the world sovereign state system. They provide some engrossing lessons about why autonomy *without* full independence and statehood is a better option in an increasingly uncertain world.

Godfrey Baldacchino  
*University of Malta, Malta*  
godfrey.baldacchino@um.edu.mt

---


Kerstin Werle’s ethnography of Lamotrek Atoll in Yap State, Federated States of Micronesia, unravels a rich cultural tapestry that draws on previous anthropological studies of this low coral island. The published PhD thesis is part of a wider interdisciplinary project aiming at a holistic understanding of Lamotrek society at the dawn of the 21st century. The project anchors itself on the influence of globalization on ethnopsychologies, personhood, and belonging. The choice of field location is premised on the idea that “the traditionally mobile Micronesians very quickly become adaptive to new cultural spaces” (p. 1). The theme of
social control is explicit in the title, although at times the reader has trouble finding a common thread in the maze of ethnographic details. They nevertheless enrich the text and provide a basis for the application of discourse-analytical cognitive anthropology, which the author combines with the anthropology of landscape to achieve an understanding of local identity construction.

The book is divided into four parts. Part 1 examines the position of women and their role in the maintenance of traditional values as symbolized by the lavalava, or wrap-around skirt, locally known as teor. As with most Micronesian societies, Lamotrek is organized around matrilineal descent, and the link between women and the land (and the parallel connection of men to the sea) provides a framework for understanding both gender relations and the opportunities presented by the “international knowledge-based society” (p. 13). Part 2 focuses on the anthropology of landscape: its epistemology and methodology, through the study of a built environment combining traditional religion with Christianity. Part 3 looks at emotions as a means to build identity within the context of conflict resolution. Part 4 sums up the concept of social control on the atoll by examining the connections between land, clan, and identity to attain the “peace culture” (p. 14), which is threatened by gender imbalance, Western religion, and alcohol abuse.

Christianity and colonialism have affected tradition and power relations on Lamotrek, in that the association of males with public space and freedom of speech has given way to a situation where women now see themselves dependent on men to make their voices heard. But as Werle argues, this perception varies according to women’s age group, with younger individuals clamouring for more rights and opportunities, some provided by the church and state bureaucratic institutions, while the older members are cautioning that such aspirations may lead to instability. On account of the strong linkage between women and land, however, the older women still consider themselves as the bearers of Lamotrekese culture, as expressed by the persistence of a symbol, the teor, an important item of female clothing and a valuable bartering object produced by women.

Part 1 examines a variety of interrelated themes, including gender roles and ageing, the maternal realm, adoption, girls’ chores, the transition to womanhood, the value of women and of teor. The latter is described both as an object of identity and a fine (when older women compel their rebellious siblings to wear traditional attire, which is also interpreted as a means of asserting women’s autonomy in policing their ranks).

The concept of ‘landscape’ is addressed in Part 2. A section on the atoll’s topography would have been more appropriate at the beginning of the book instead of being amalgamated with a discussion on landscape. Here we learn of the author’s experiences and emotions as she first encounters Lamotrek on board a ship. After a few days, she remarks that the density and variety of the local flora, fauna, and built environment provide a buffer against the dreaded “island fever” or the feeling of living in a confined space. Against the backdrop of Western-inspired landscape painting and insights provided by the anthropology of landscape, Werle attempts to make sense of local reflections where every piece of land is named, possesses its history of owners, and carries its own character. This is in opposition to the 18th century European view of landscape seen through art and science that position nature outside of culture. The Lamotrek landscape by contrast is shaped “by the way people talk about it, how people work the land and how they approach it”, at the individual or clan level, for example, thus avoiding the separation of nature from culture (p. 88).
The focal point of the author’s study of landscape on the atoll relates to the construction of an initiation place, which is in turn shaped by the existing landscape. The initiation into adult Catholic community through a religious retreat is a good example of performance, “defining and placing the Lamotrekese concept of person in island time and based upon certain places” (p. 110). Drawing on Emile Durkheim’s notion of time and space mediated through collective life and Arnold van Gennep’s study of ritual marking the transition of life stages, Werle details the process of separation, liminality, and integration of young people as church members. We are told that efforts to reactivate local traditions blended with Christian beliefs (Christianity was introduced in 1938) may be attributed to awareness among local participants of cultural erosion, together with a rise in environmental problems.

The link between landscape and emotions is taken up in the third part of the book. Conflict on the atoll is said to be influenced and resolved depending on locality. As opposed to people’s changeable attitudes, the land’s character is perceived as immovable, thus enabling individuals to find solace, without losing face, in specific settings: such as, for example, when an offended party has made its way back to his/her mother’s land following a dispute. Moreover, the handling of age in relation to gender reduces conflict between generations.

Part 4 sums up the issue of social control on an island with less than 1 km² of dry land and with a resident population of 373, according to the Yap State Census Report for 2000, six years prior to Werle’s arrival. We are reminded that colonialism’s role in encouraging patrilineal succession, together with men’s reluctance to listen to women’s requests at the public political level, has led to conflict. As a result, women have organized themselves to hold their own meetings covering a range of topics, including rules of dress, behaviour of youth, offences, alcohol abuse, festive events, and health issues. Despite these pressures, matrilineal inheritance is still recognized and respected, guaranteeing women’s traditional power. Power may be further expressed by the contrasting views of the landscape for men and women. The men see the landscape as a shifting physical entity as they progress through life and set up residence elsewhere after marriage; while the women are custodians of the land, which embodies tradition, but is also affected by changes occurring beyond the physical boundaries of Lamotrek. As a result, for the women, it is “the meaning of the landscape that changes, which offers a constant source of reflection” (p. 196).

Landscape of peace provides a remarkable insight into the contemporary social conditions on a Micronesian atoll. Far from being isolated from the outside world, the inhabitants of Lamotrek have shown their ability to adapt to novel ideas about modernity, decision-making, and inheritance to minimize conflict and seek harmony across gender- and age-related issues. It serves as a complementary and updated text to Francis Hezel’s The new shape of old island cultures: A half century of social change in Micronesia (2001). The book has an extensive bibliography and a glossary. An index is lacking and some of the black and white photographs could be of better quality; but these are minor points in an otherwise rich and insightful ethnography.

Frank R. Thomas
University of the South Pacific, Fiji Islands
frank.thomas@usp.ac.fj